## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Services we provide</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Message from the President and CEO</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About us</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRIM in numbers</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRIM highlights; 2018</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highlights of 2018</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRIM initiated projects</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Social Well-being Survey of Mongolia</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Monitoring of transparency in websites of state agencies</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implemented projects</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Real time Monitoring of the impact of Fiscal Tightening and Changes on Social Welfare Spending</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Urban governance project: Develop manuals on Research Methodology and Microsoft Excel program</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Feasibility Study for a Sustainable Cashmere Project in the Eastern Steppe</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Integrated Results-based Management – National consultancy</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Needs assessment survey of the ‘Promoting Inclusive Education Focusing on Every Last Child in Mongolia’ project</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Development of an instrument for Country Portfolio Reviews for German Development Cooperation: A case study in Mongolia - National consultancy</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Business integrity country agenda</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Public private partnership policy and regulation development of the Capital City</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. End-line survey of the ‘Women’s Business Center’ project</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Monitoring and evaluation study on Tracking Community Behavior Changes Resulting from Training on ‘Mining and Water Management in the South Gobi’ and ‘Water Monitoring’ Modules</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Socio-economic baseline study of Local Protected Area households, Bulgan soum Arkhangai aimag</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projects in progress</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Action plan for implementation of the State Policy on Health Development Project</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Gobi Framework for Sustainable Infrastructure Partnerships: Scaling up praxis from Mongolia to Central Asia</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Review of ‘National Evaluation Systems and Capacities for Evaluating Progress towards the SDGs’ Country case study</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Result-based Monitoring: Data Gathering and Analysis for Performance Indicators of ‘Support to Mongolia’s Technical and Vocational Education and Training Sector’ project</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Gender Assessment of Public Service Accessability of Under-Represented groups in Ulaanbaatar</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SERVICES WE PROVIDE

RESEARCH - IRIM has research experience in a wide range of sectors, where professional and scientific approaches are applied. IRIM’s staff are experienced in designing and facilitating innovative and inter-disciplinary research projects, drawing on both quantitative and qualitative approaches. Data quality assurance is conducted at every stage in research projects, and the latest versions of statistical analysis software are employed.

MONITORING AND EVALUATION - Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) projects make up around one third of IRIM’s portfolio. With an emphasis on evidence, and employing internationally accepted methodologies and methods, IRIM conducts independent analysis of the implementation of the government and the international organisations’ projects and programmes. IRIM initiated the Mongolian Evaluation Network; making a commitment to integrate evaluation standards in Mongolia in collaboration with other members of the Network.

TRAINING AND WORKSHOPS - IRIM’s training packages cover current research theories and methods and are enriched by the application of extensive experience in the field. IRIM provides training on various subjects, including: transparent budgeting, civic engagement, organisational capacity-building, and horizontal learning methods. IRIM employs participatory and interactive methodologies in workshops. IRIM ensures success of the workshop (from beginning to end), developing training materials, conducting participants’ needs assessment, documenting all procedures of the workshops and conducting satisfaction surveys. This provides for continuous improvement of performance of workshops’ organization and facilitation.

PROJECT MANAGEMENT - IRIM does more than research alone; implementing a wide range of consultancies and advocacy projects (to influence policy-makers) which include:

- Conducting analysis of development policy documents and providing recommendations
- Conducting internal and external, environment analyses and developing capacity-building and strategic planning activities.

EXPERIENCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXPERIENCE</th>
<th>94 projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MONITORING AND EVALUATION</td>
<td>60 projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRAINING AND WORKSHOPS</td>
<td>18 projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROJECT MANAGEMENT</td>
<td>22 projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In 2018, the Mongolian economy performed encouragingly; with growth reaching 6.4%, international trade turnover increased, and the government budget in surplus. However, there was no significant improvement in elevating livelihoods and reducing poverty. Moreover, Mongolia entered into a social crisis; facing serious challenges in accomplishing its long term development agenda of promoting equal access to economic growth.

Within the domain of governance, there remained a growing need to improve government’s financial and operational transparency, and to reduce corruption risks. Although Mongolia improved its performance and advanced its global ranking by ten places (according to the Corruption Perception Index) Transparency International noted that there was ‘little to no progress on anti-corruption’. Protection and strengthening of founding institutions - for democracy and good governance - became more relevant than ever. Freedom of speech, freedom of assembly, and civil society’s capacities (and operations) are all facing an increased threat of restrictions as a result of newly adopted and forthcoming legal regulations.

The Government of Mongolia redefined its development goals; aiming to develop a long term development plan for the next 25 years. However, this would not be possible without building and strengthening development policy planning, and monitoring and evaluation capacity at all levels of government. Public-private partnership, universal cooperation and coherent action, remain among the priorities to accomplish national development objectives. In the past 11 years since its establishment in 2008, IRIM has continued to reinforce cooperation with the Government of Mongolia. This has included working with the Ministry of Finance, Cabinet Secretariat, local government institutions, development partners and other stakeholders; promoting development policy planning, and supporting M&E capacity and practices in Mongolia. In doing so, IRIM has always maintained close cooperation with international professional associations and networks, to bring international best practices and innovative solutions to address the most pressing issues in Mongolia.

In times of social turbulence and challenges, governance, independent and professional research and evaluation are more important than ever, in: protecting human rights and democracy, strengthening the rule of law, and achieving inclusive growth. In response, IRIM initiated and organized the International Conference on Democracy in the 21st Century: Challenges and Ways Forward in Ulaanbaatar. The Conference facilitated discussions - about the global and local challenges to democracy, and current developments - among international and Mongolian scholars, practitioners, policy makers and other stakeholders.

None of IRIM’s work implemented over the past eleven years would have been possible without our clients, independent and professional consultants, researchers and partners - from every field - who aspired to bring about positive changes, with a sincere belief in IRIM’s vision. The Institute will persist in its aspirations of creating sustainable and growing cooperation, common values and impacts, through independent and professional research, analysis and consultancy.

As in previous years, IRIM presents this Annual Report to those who are interested in Mongolia’s development issues - practitioners, researchers and decision makers - with our best intention to give a brief insight to IRIM’s projects and some key findings from activities undertaken in 2018.

May our readers’ efforts in development during the next year continue Mongolia’s advancement.
The Independent Research Institute of Mongolia (IRIM) was established in 2008, with a staff of four people. Since then, it has expanded its operations and now has more than 25 fulltime staff, and over 300 associated (national and international) experts and researchers.

IRIM delivers research, monitoring and evaluation, and training services; working mainly with public sector clients, international organizations and donors. Through its work, IRIM strives to achieve real outcomes in solving some of the most pressing development issues.

Since its establishment, IRIM has always been committed to providing results-based and client-centred project management solutions. Additionally, IRIM has always been guided by the principles of providing evidence-based and high quality information, maintaining an independent and impartial perspective, and striving for improved impacts within society.

IRIM’s current research and consultancy covers an increasing range of issues within governance, education, labour markets and mining; among others.

IRIM expanded its scope into the field of marketing and innovation research, and subsequently established the Marketing and Innovation Research Institute of Mongolia (MIRIM) in 2013.
IRIM IN NUMBERS

181 TOTAL PROJECTS

2008 April
82 Governance
31 Education
24 Mining and Environment
10 Labor & Employment
34 Other

139021 Respondents
90 Clients
149 Partners

PROJECTS IMPLEMENTED AREAS

Ulaanbaatar 127
Khovd 51
Umnugobi 42
Darkhan-Uul 38
Dornogobi 34
Bayankhongor 36
Gobi-Altai 35
Uvurkhangai 37
Khovd 35
Selenge 34
Dornod 34
Khuvsgul 36
Khentii 31
Arkhangai 31
Bulgan 19
Erliyan city in China 1

IRIM membership

As a member of the International Sociological Association (ISA), IRIM affirms its commitment to the ‘Code of Ethics’, approved by the ISA’s Executive Committee.

IRIM became a member of the African Evaluation Association (AfrEA) in August 2016. Since 2017, IRIM has started working as an AfrEA board member.

IRIM initiated the Mongolian Evaluation Network; that integrates government and non-government organizations’ representatives, international experts and consultants. In collaboration with other members, IRIM is committed to practicing international evaluation standards in Mongolia.

In 2016, IRIM initiated the ‘Subjective well-being study’ for the first time in Mongolia. In October 2017, IRIM became a member of ‘East and East Asian Social Well-being Research Consortium’.

In 2016, IRIM became a member of the National Committee on Gender Equality, in 2017. Representing CSOs and the private sector, IRIM is making efforts to ensure gender equality in social science sectors and mainstream gender equality in government policies.

In 2010, IRIM became an Executive Committee member of the ‘Partnership for Social Accountability, Mongolia’ and a member of the Affiliated Network for Social Accountability in East Asia and the Pacific (ANSA-EAP). IRIM became a member of the Central Asian Countries’ The Innovation for Change Initiative in 2017. Since September 2018, IRIM has been working as a board member of the network.

IRIM became a freelance member of the National Committee on Gender Equality, in 2017. Representing CSOs and the private sector, IRIM is making efforts to ensure gender equality in social science sectors and mainstream gender equality in government policies.

IRIM became a member of the National Committee on Gender Equality, in 2017. Representing CSOs and the private sector, IRIM is making efforts to ensure gender equality in social science sectors and mainstream gender equality in government policies.

IRIM membership

International Organisations
Government
NGO
Private sector & person

Partner organisations

IRIM membership

As a member of the International Sociological Association (ISA), IRIM affirms its commitment to the ‘Code of Ethics’, approved by the ISA’s Executive Committee.

IRIM became a member of the African Evaluation Association (AfrEA) in August 2016. Since 2017, IRIM has started working as an AfrEA board member.

IRIM initiated the Mongolian Evaluation Network; that integrates government and non-government organizations’ representatives, international experts and consultants. In collaboration with other members, IRIM is committed to practicing international evaluation standards in Mongolia.

In 2016, IRIM initiated the ‘Subjective well-being study’ for the first time in Mongolia. In October 2017, IRIM became a member of ‘East and East Asian Social Well-being Research Consortium’.

In 2016, IRIM initiated the ‘Subjective well-being study’ for the first time in Mongolia. In October 2017, IRIM became a member of ‘East and East Asian Social Well-being Research Consortium’.

IRIM became a freelance member of the National Committee on Gender Equality, in 2017. Representing CSOs and the private sector, IRIM is making efforts to ensure gender equality in social science sectors and mainstream gender equality in government policies.

In 2010, IRIM became an Executive Committee member of the ‘Partnership for Social Accountability, Mongolia’ and a member of the Affiliated Network for Social Accountability in East Asia and the Pacific (ANSA-EAP). IRIM became a member of the Central Asian Countries’ The Innovation for Change Initiative in 2017. Since September 2018, IRIM has been working as a board member of the network.
January
IRIM signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the Griffith University of Australia.

February
IRIM organized a research dissemination workshop on "Promoting effective mining sector governance through capacity building research and engaging program" under the Australian Awards Fellowship Program (funded by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Government of Australia).

March
IRIM participated in the 'Strategic Development Consultative Meeting' held in Almaty, Kazakhstan.

April
IRIM celebrated the Tenth Anniversary of its establishment.

May
IRIM organized the 'Using Panel Data Methods' seminar in collaboration with the National University of Mongolia. The seminar was presented by PhD Lkhagvasuren D, consultant of IRIM.

June
IRIM began implementing the long-term project 'The Action Plan for the Implementation of the State Policy on Health Development', commissioned by the Asian Development Bank with funding from the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction.

July
IRIM organized the international conference 'Democracy in the 21st Century: Challenges and Ways Forward'

August
IRIM, in collaboration with the University of Oxford's Geography and the Environment, and the University of Central Asia's Institute of Public Policy and Administration, started implementation of the project 'Gobi Framework for Sustainable Infrastructure Partnerships: Scaling up Praxis from Mongolia to Central Asia'.

September
IRIM was elected as a board member of the Innovation for Change Central Asia Hub.

October
IRIM attended the 2018 Annual Meeting of the Boards of Governors of the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank Group.

November

December
IRIM organised and hosted its Annual Reception - for key stakeholders and partners – and presented the results of its latest nationwide surveys: 'Social Well-being Survey of Mongolia' and 'Assessment of the government agencies website transparency.'
IRIM CELEBRATED ITS 10th ANNIVERSARY

In 2018, IRIM celebrated the 10th Anniversary of its establishment. Since 2008, IRIM has been operating sustainably within the vision of becoming a world-class professional organisation that provides high-quality, independent consulting services and research outcomes, and impact. IRIM has successfully conducted more than 180 research, monitoring, evaluation and consultancy projects, that have contributed to social development.

On 4 April, IRIM hosted an anniversary celebration with associated organizations, consultants and representatives; to validate the above-mentioned achievements. Highlights of IRIM’s 10th anniversary included:

Researchers’ sport day: In April, the 10th anniversary basketball and table tennis competition were organized, involving partners working in the social research sector. A total of 16 teams competed very sportingly; with all proceeds from donated to the medical expenses of Temuulen B.

Panel data seminar: In May, in collaboration with the School of Science, National University of Mongolia (NUM), the Panel Data Seminar was organized for policymakers, researchers and students. The Seminar was led by IRIM consultant, PhD Lkhagvasuren D. and the US PSID (also known as the Panel Study of Income Dynamics Data) was analyzed on the Stata program.

International conference: In collaboration with the World Society Foundation (WSF), the international conference on Democracy in the 21st Century: Challenges and Ways Forward was organized in July, in Ulaanbaatar. The Conference brought together more than 30 scholars and researchers from 12 countries, to discuss their research findings.

Independent nationwide survey: IRIM conducted the internally funded Social Well-Being of Mongolia and Monitoring of Transparency in Websites of State Agencies. The research reports were published, and introduced to clients and partners.

IRIM ORGANIZED THE INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE DEMOCRACY IN THE 21st CENTURY: CHALLENGES AND WAYS FORWARD IN MONGOLIA

IRIM in collaboration with the World Society Foundation (WSF) organized the international conference on Democracy in the 21st Century: Challenges and Ways Forward on 9 and 10 July, 2018.

The objective of the Conference was to provide an academic environment - for scholars from around the world - to engage and discuss the status of democracy. The Conference brought together 94 participants, of whom one-third were international scholars from 12 different countries. Mongolian participants - interested in the topic of democracy - also presented their papers.
The Conference opening speeches were delivered by the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, Deputy Minister of Justice and Home Affairs as well as the Ambassador of Switzerland to Mongolia, marking the importance and timeliness of the Conference. In the Conference, participants discussed future collaborative research and proposals to implement advocacy projects to advance awareness about democracy. More information on the Conference is provided in the projects section of this report and copies of papers can be found on the IRIM website at http://irim.mn/conference.

IRIM ATTENDED THE CONFERENCES OF ASIAN CONSORTIUM FOR SOCIAL WELL-BEING STUDIES

In 2017, IRIM became a member of the Social Well-Being Research Consortium in Asia. IRIM is an active member of the Consortium and in 2018, attended a number of international conferences, and presented the findings of the Social Well-being of Mongolia. The conferences were as follows:

• Third conference, titled Social well-being, social policy and social change was held in Magelang city, Central Java, Indonesia. The conference sought to identify the current situation and ways to improve social well-being in an era of rapid modernization in Asia. The Conference brought together IRIM’s CEO Mr Batsugar Tsedendamba and Board member Ms Dolgion Aldar, along with scholars and researchers from nine Asian, member countries. They presented research papers on subjects such as social capital, discrimination, networks, participation and happiness indices. IRIM chaired the session on Development and Well-Being and presented the Institute’s findings on the current state of subjective well-being of the poor in Mongolia.

• Fourth conference, titled Social Well-Being in the Asian Context: From a Comparative Perspective was held in Seoul, South Korea. IRIM’s Research Manager, Mr Dashzeveg Lhagvanorov, participated. The Conference sought to investigate the current status and mechanism to improve social well-being in Asia.

• Fifth conference, titled Balancing the Outcomes of Globalization: Roles of Social Well-Being was held in Tokyo Japan, in November 2018. IRIM Board member Mr Bold Tsevegdorj and Ms Dolgion Aldar, CEO Mr Batsugar Tsedendamba and Research Manager Mr Dashzeveg Lhagvanorov participated; presenting papers on ‘Considering the poverty and inequality: Social well-being policies in Mongolia’ and ‘The Findings from Mongolia’s Subjective Well Being Survey 2017: Mining Sector Trust Level in Mongolian Gobi Region’.

The papers presented by IRIM were based on interesting social issues, to which IRIM will remain committed; to continue research and provide findings to the public. This will facilitate global comparisons of Mongolia’s situation.
IRIM ORGANIZED AND HOSTED ITS ANNUAL RECEPTION 2018

In 2015, IRIM started a tradition to host an Annual Reception named after IRIM’s president and ambassador, Dr Bekhbat Khasbazar. The Reception highlights a different subject each year; chosen to widen understandings and increase stakeholders’ participation. During the 2018 reception, IRIM’s CEO, Mr Batsugar Tsedendamba, presented the first findings of the Social Well-Being Survey of Mongolia to more than 30 guests. The audience included: international partners, embassy representatives, sector experts and government officials. It is hoped that the Social Well-being Survey of Mongolia will help to improve people’s understanding of the factors driving societal progress and will strengthen the evidence-base for policy making.


IRIM Board member Ms Dolgion Aldar attended the 26th Annual Meeting of the Boards of Governors of the IMF and the World Bank Group. During the Conference, international representatives discussed subjects such as the global economy, international development and financial markets.

In the paper ‘Engaging with the IMF: Learning from Different Experiences’, the IMF recommended (when implementing programs) the following: to listen to civil society organization, to disclose information when operating, to be transparent and to introduce social impact assessment criteria (to develop indicators for evaluating the implementation of program documents). It is commendable that the IMF has started to incorporate inequality, gender, social protection and environment-related policies into their operations. They stated that it is important to include performance indicators of program evaluation in order for such issues to be implemented.

IRIM JOINED THE INNOVATION FOR CHANGE INITIATIVE

IRIM became a member of the Central Asian Innovation for Change Initiative in 2018. Innovation for Change (I4C) is a global network of over 200 international civil society organizations. They aim to defend the rights of civil society organizations and identify approaches to the challenges faced by them. The Network operates in nine regions worldwide, including: Africa, East Asia, Central Asia and the Middle East.

IRIM represents Mongolia, as one of the seven member countries in Central Asia. IRIM staff have attended three capacity building trainings and meetings. IRIM CEO Mr Batsugar Tsedendamba was elected as a member of the Board of the I4C Initiative. Within this initiative IRIM’s Transparency in Websites of Government Agencies project has been selected and IRIM will continue to demonstrate its experience of monitoring government transparency, empower CSOs and demonstrate its methodology globally.
CLIENT’S NAME
In-house project; internally funded by IRIM.

SURVEY OBJECTIVES
The general objectives were: to establish a database of subjective well-being, gather evidence needed for policymaking, and provide insights on how Mongolians evaluated their lives in a rapidly changing society. Particular objectives included:

- Provide better measures of well-being.
- Provide better assessments of the country’s comparative performance in various fields.
- Strengthen the evidence-base for policy making.
- Establish a policy evaluation platform.
Data collection was conducted in 12 aimags (Arkhangai, Darkhan-Uul, Dornod, Govi-Altai, Khentii, Khovd, Khuvsgul, Orkhon, Umnugovi, Uvurkhangai, Selenge and Zavkhan) and Ulaanbaatar.

BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE

Notions of subjective well-being (or happiness) have a long tradition as central elements in the quality of life, but until very recently these concepts were generally deemed beyond the scope of statistical measurement. Over the last two decades however, an increasing body of evidence has shown that subjective well-being can be measured in surveys; that such measures are valid and reliable, and they can usefully inform policy-making. This evidence has been reflected in an exponential growth in the economic literature on measures of subjective well-being. Recognising the importance of subjective aspects of development, significant progress has been made internationally in well-being measures, through internationally comparable surveys, such as: the Asian Barometer, European Social Survey, Eurobarometer, Gallup World Poll, Latino barometer, OECD Better Life Index and the World Values Survey.

Despite progress being made internationally in measuring well-being, there was still a lack of detailed studies about subjective well-being and social cohesion in Mongolia. Accordingly, in 2016, IRIM, as an independent research institute aiming to contribute to positive impacts in Mongolia, initiated its own social survey on these topics. The data was to provide evidence on the following:
- The well-being of **people** rather than on the macro-economic conditions of economies.
- The well-being of **different groups** of the population, in addition to average conditions.
- Measures of **inequalities** in people’s conditions.
- Well-being achievements, measured by **outcome indicators**.
- **Objective and subjective aspects** of people’s well-being.

The Survey covered representative samples and is internationally comparable. It was conducted in a consistent way, across different population groups and over time.

In 2016, IRIM became a member of the Social Well-Being Research Consortium in Asia. As a member, IRIM was able to contribute to activities under four focus areas of the research project, namely:

- Conducting cross-national questionnaires.
- Participating and presenting the results and findings, at symposia and conferences.
- Publishing research results and findings (in English) in the associated journal.
- Presenting research results and findings (in Japanese) in the associated journal.

IRIM will continue to share the results with academics, policymakers and development practitioners in Asia and beyond.

**SURVEY DESIGN**

In developing the study tools, IRIM relied on *Guideline on Measuring Subjective Well-being* (OECD, 2013). The questionnaire related to respondents’ demographics, and factors impacting upon quality of life and material conditions. The questionnaire was comprised of five sections, namely: general subjective well-being, life evaluation, eudemonic happiness, domain evaluation, and affect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>'life evaluation'</th>
<th>a reflective assessment on a person’s life or some specific aspect of it</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'eudemonia'</td>
<td>a sense of meaning and purpose in life, or good psychological functioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'affect'</td>
<td>a person’s feelings (or emotional states) typically measured with reference to a particular point in time</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Between 2016 and 2017, data collection was conducted in 12 aimags and Ulaanbaatar, covering a sample size of 1,825 respondents. Cluster sampling, random cluster, and intercept line sampling methods were employed. The data collection coincided with major national events, at different times of the year, which highlighted trends in the data over time and revealed factors influencing people’s happiness. Such events included:

- 9 to 20 June, 2016; Parliamentary election (summer).
- 8 to 15 September 2016; Start of the school year (autumn).
- 1 to 12 February, 2017; 49% stocks of Erdenet Mining Corporation (winter).

**FINDINGS**

*Overall, how satisfied are you with your life as a whole these days?*

Mongolians seemed satisfied with their own lives. This value – of 7.9 - was a relatively high score compared to other countries; similar to Nordic countries (about 7.5) and better than Syrians, Burundians and Central Africans (whose ratings were the worst, at around 3.0) according to the Gallup World Poll of 2017. Respondents also indicated they were relatively happy and their lives were worthwhile. This could be linked to Mongolian’s way of thinking and higher, relational well-being.
Survey respondents were more satisfied with their present life than they had been previously. They were even more optimistic about their future. The level of subjective well-being declined among older respondents.

**CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

Based on the analysis of people’s incomes and subjective well-being, it was evident that the level of subjective well-being increased as income increased; and was one of the factors affecting subjective well-being.

People working in state organizations exhibited higher levels of subjective well-being. Rural locations were associated with more positive effects on people’s levels of subjective well-being, and less negative effects. People were least satisfied with the country’s economic and political situation, and most satisfied with their own personal lives (and those of their personal groups).

To provide more significant conclusions, the survey needs to be repeated. IRIM will need the help of supporters, partners and champions to turn the data into better policies and investments, that will truly improve people’s lives. IRIM intends to continue measuring social cohesion and subjective well-being in Mongolia. It will also publish the data online, make it available in English and Mongolian, expand its coverage and extend its outreach for meaningful policy change.

Join IRIM’s efforts.

- Make a financial contribution to IRIM’s survey mission.
- Donate your time and volunteer.
- Use IRIM’s survey report and data in your work.
- Establish academic partnerships with IRIM.
- Establish policy partnerships with IRIM.
- Share your thoughts about the survey.
CLIENT'S NAME
In-house project; internally funded by IRIM.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The general objective of the monitoring was to measure the regulation and implementation of transparency in websites of government agencies based on the Law on Right to Information and Transparency. This was to be accomplished by monitoring the websites of state agencies and developing recommendations to improve their transparency.

Particular objectives of the monitoring included:

• Adhere to the principles of the monitoring methodology used in previous years (to facilitate comparisons). The monitoring was evaluated according to the agency’s activities, human resources, budget and procurement transparency.
• Evaluate budget and procurement transparency based on indicators in the Law on Glass Account.
• Rank the agencies by the transparency of information.
• Develop recommendations for improving transparency in websites of government agencies.
The monitoring evaluated 81 official websites of government agencies, including:

- Ministries, 13.
- Implementing agencies, 17.
- Regulatory agencies, 10.
- Local government agencies, 21.
- Administrative divisions and district agencies, 11.
- Parliamentary agencies, 9.

BACKGROUND

One key element of a good government is transparency. The main tool, to support and enhance the relationship between government and citizens, is the government’s websites. In Mongolia, the ‘Electronic Mongolia’ national program was approved in 2004 and the Law on Information Transparency and Right to Information was adopted by Resolution No. 143 (approved in 2008). The legislation provides for strengthening the relationship between government and citizens, by providing: transparency, openness, accountability and ethics of state agencies, and information on budgeting and expenditure. However, citizens and civil society organizations have stated that the transparency in websites of government agencies lack of compliance with the legislation.

Based on the legal documents mentioned above, IRIM began annual monitoring of the transparency of government agency websites; with the latest being the seventh consecutive year. The results of the annual monitoring and evaluation provide a benchmark, where changes in the ranking can indicate changes in the performance of government agency websites.

PROJECT DESIGN

The monitoring was implemented in three stages:

- Examine websites, to evaluate the implementation of regulations (with reference to indicators).
- Evaluate the results, in comparison with the monitoring reports of previous years.
- Rank government agencies’ website by their average scores.

IRIM determined which indicators were the most important - in transparency — and weighted them accordingly. The importance of the indicators - in measuring transparency - was as shown in the figure.

Figure 1. Indicators’ Importance in Measuring Transparency

FINDINGS

The 81 government agencies’ websites were categorized in to the 4 transparency indicators based on the percentage of indicators completed. According to this, the average percentage of agencies that were ‘transparent in some ways’ was 52.8%. Though this was an improvement of 35 percentage points since the start of the annual monitoring, it was a decrease of two percentage points since the previous annual
survey of 2017. Government agencies remain to be in ‘the transparent in some ways’ category since 2015.

Figure 2. Government Agencies’ Transparency (%)

In the last two years’ surveys, there was no government agency with a website in the category ‘fully transparent’. In 2018, 22 agencies’ website (27%) were ‘transparent’, 46 (57%) were ‘transparent in some ways’ and 16% were ‘closed’ with unqualified scores for each indicator.

Figure 3-1. Level of Transparency in Government Agencies’ websites, 2017

Compared to the previous year, there were no significant changes in the proportion of websites considered ‘transparent’; but 11 agencies moved (deteriorated) from being ‘transparent in some ways’ to being ‘closed.’

The evaluations of the five indicators are shown below in details.

Figure 4. Results of the five indicators are shown below in details, 2018

The indicators were divided by their importance within the evaluation. It shows that the government agencies have only half performance in each of the five indicators. From the five indicators, ‘usability of information’ seems to be slightly higher, which means that agencies appear to have relatively good website designs. In particular, the fonts, clear menu and color coordination, which were above 97%.

The followings are the results of measuring transparency in accordance with 4 indicators of information.

Figure 5. Transparency; Based on the Four Indicators of Information
Transparency of the four information indicators based on the ‘Law on Information Transparency and the Right to Information’ (LIGRI), were around 50%. Compared to 2017, the transparency of procurement had increased by 1.4%, while the other categories had decreased. In particular, the transparency in budget had improved fairly well since the previous year, but has become the worst information indicator this year, dropping by 6.2% and also transparency of activities dropping by 3.8% and human resources by 3.3%.

IRIM categorized government agencies based on their functions, such as: ministries, implementing agencies, regulatory agencies, local government, administrative divisions (and districts) and parliamentary agencies. All six categories were evaluated as being ‘transparent in some ways’.

Table 1. Total score of Transparency in Agencies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>№</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Score, %</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ministries</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>59.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Implementing agencies</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>59.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Regulatory agencies</td>
<td>51.8</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Local government agencies</td>
<td>60.4</td>
<td>51.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Administrative and district agencies</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>45.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Parliamentary agencies</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>48.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td>54.6</td>
<td>52.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementing agencies improved by 4%, compared to the previous year, qualifying as ‘transparent’. An interesting result shows the transparency of local governments and districts—with the highest percentage in 2017 - dropped by about 10 percentage points in 2018.

CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Overall, the monitoring showed that transparency of government agencies’ websites had not improved significantly, and most agencies continued to be in the category of ‘40-60 points’ (so-called ‘transparent in some ways’). The results were presented, in detail, for each agency to review on IRIM’s website. Letters were sent to each agency, with a suggestion to review the results of their website’s transparency. In accordance with the official letter, agencies will review the results and take action based on our monitoring report.

Continuation of the monitoring and evaluation of government agencies websites remains very important.
REAL TIME MONITORING OF THE IMPACT OF FISCAL TIGHTENING AND CHANGES ON SOCIAL WELFARE SPENDING

CLIENT’S NAME
The United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The project was grounded on several emerging issues, such as: ‘Child Money’ (CM) program changes, amendments to regulation for its disbursement, frequent changes of Cabinet, and failure to stabilise disbursement (caused by fiscal tightening and government’s obligations in international agreements). The objective was to evaluate social and economic impacts - from changes in social welfare policies - on children and the families of target groups, by conducting monitoring. To do so, IRIM developed nine indicators to measure (on a monthly basis) and report the results and changes (quarterly) with the comparisons of each period. The indicators were based on the following questions:

• What decisions related to social welfare spending (especially the child money program) does the Mongolian government make during real time monitoring?
• How are decisions implemented at the central and local government levels? Are there any delays, obstacles, and procedural issues?
• How do decisions impact upon target households, especially their decision spending on food, health, safety, and children’s education?
• Are there any indications of impacts on child’s wellbeing?
BACKGROUND

As a large-scale social welfare program, the Child Money Program (CMP) and its financial stability have significant impact on supporting household livelihoods and reducing income poverty. Effective from 2005, and following an amendment to the Law on Social Welfare, the State Great Khural (Parliament of Mongolia) started implementation of the CMP for the purpose of promoting population growth and child development. The program covered all children until December 2017. However, in accordance with an agreement with IMF (May 2017), the Government of Mongolia agreed to change the policy of the program and disburse Child money (CM) to 60% of all children, and to increase the scope further (provided that the economic situation improved). Economic growth reached 1.2% in 2016, 5.3% in 2017 and 6.4% as of the end of September, 2018. All of which made the balance of payment positive. Grounded on this excess revenue, the Government made a decision on 30 May, 2018 to disburse the CM allowance to 80% of all children in the country. Problems, such as government changes, discontinuation of CM due to state budget, international agreements, and the inability to reach target groups, have all become the basis for implementing the project.

PROJECT DESIGN

The research was conducted in the following two stages:

- Studying changes in social welfare policy.
- Studying the impact of social welfare policies on households and children.

The monitoring measured nine indicators, through qualitative and quantitative methods. For the quantitative information, a questionnaire was completed among target respondents every month. For the qualitative information, individual interviews were conducted in two stages:

- Quarterly interviews with survey respondents.
- Individual interviews with social welfare sector experts, regarding policy changes and implementation of social welfare program (especially the ‘Child Money Program’).
Secondary sources of information, such as policy documents, other surveys and data on social welfare policies (especially the ‘Child Money Program’) were also examined.

Based on the population density, poverty index, inter-city distance, animal husbandry and artisanal gold mining indicators, and as agreed with the client, the data collection areas were determined as Erdenetsogt and Gurvanbulag soums of Bayankhongor aimag, and in Ulaanbaatar the 7th khoroo of Songinokhairkhan district and the 9th khoroo of Bayanzurkh district. Target households were randomly selected, based on: the ‘Household Living Standards Measurement Survey’, the number of children in households, their status as single-headed households, and whether they had a disabled family member.

**FINDINGS**

As income sources and sizes vary, so households’ dependence level on social welfare also varies, in rural and urban areas. Unlike rural households, urban households can find jobs easily and earn better salaries, but they have no optional income sources aside from salaries. Conversely, rural areas do not have access to an adequate number of stable jobs, but can earn additional income from animal husbandry. For example, analyses of the dependence on welfare allowances of 140 families (throughout the year) demonstrated that urban households were on average 33.3% dependent, and rural households were 14.5% dependent.

![Figure 1. Share of social welfare income in target 140 household’s average income, by urban and rural areas](image)

CM is definitely a factor directly influencing to ensure households livelihood that is based on permanent and stable income, and the well-being of children. Welfare allowance is the most secure source among all types of household incomes at this time that availability of stable and long-term jobs is scarce.

Households use welfare allowances more for their livelihoods, while they borrow from banks and financial institutions for achieving their bigger goals, such as: buying/building a warm and comfortable house, providing good education for children, and financing admission to university (which they think will secure the future of the children). This is verified by the fact that most families plan welfare money for their daily needs (including food) followed by borrowing from banks for other needs; making larger investment from their salaries and other incomes.

The households tie their social welfare allowance and CM to the daily expenses, has already become a tradition. It is evidenced by the observation that when the CM is not disbursed on time, they increasingly buy goods on credit or borrow by collateralizing their property. When they receive welfare allowance, particularly the CM, they release their property from lien and reduce purchase of goods on credit. For example, in September and October, and early November - the times that CM was delayed - families purchased fuel and warm clothes by collateralizing their assets. As opposed to these months, collateralization of jewelries reduced two-folds in late November, when the CM was paid.
Families with many children and poor livelihoods ran out of cash reserves even before disbursement of the CM, so they bought foodstuff from nearby grocery stores on credit. When the CM was paid (on the twentieth of each month) they paid back the loan and bought food from wholesale markets using any surplus.

In disbursing some social welfare allowances - specially the CM and Food Vouchers - scores that households get on Household Livelihood Standard Measurement Survey (HLSMS) and the households’ base survey - are taken into account, to determine their eligibility. But evaluation for the scoring applies proxy means testing, which determine if the family: has real estate, the family’s housing conditions, and the number of persons with the capacity to work. But the evaluation fails to properly determine households’ ability to ensure the stable and reliable supply of food; the basic need of a family.

**CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

The ‘Real Time Monitoring of the Impact of Fiscal Tightening and Changes on Social Welfare Spending’ project’s outcomes and recommendations can be used to develop, update, and improve the social welfare policy and its implementation. The results of the first quarter were disseminated and discussions undertaken with stakeholders, including representatives from: the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection, General Agency for Labour and Social Welfare, social welfare workers of target areas, and with the support from UNICEF. Currently, the project team is preparing for final dissemination of the project’s results.
CLIENT'S NAME
The Asian Foundation (TAF)
Municipality of Ulaanbaatar (MUB)
Finance provided by Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective was to support the development of skills of khoroo, district and city level public officers; as required to provide quality professional services to citizens and improve the productivity and efficiency of their work. This also included strengthening the capacity of public administration organization officers to use research methods and Microsoft Excel (for beginners, intermediate and advanced level staff). Manuals on each content were to be developed, and provided along with the training-of-trainers (ToT).
BACKGROUND

The Urban Governance Project aims to deliver information about the challenges of residents (of Ulaanbaatar) to planners and decision makers. It also seeks to:

- Improve the quality of khoroo’s services for citizens.
- Strengthen the knowledge and capacity-building of khoroo governors, social workers and organizers (to facilitate contributions to the citizens’ livelihoods).

The capacity building training for civil servants was organized by the MUB and TAF, and funded by the SDC.

PROJECT DESIGN

The following activities were implemented during the project:

- Organisation of a ‘Needs Assessment’ workshop to develop manuals based on the requirements of civil servants.
- Organisation of a ‘Pilot Training’ workshop to receive recommendations and suggestions from TAF, MUB and project beneficiaries on improved manuals (prepared after the ‘Needs Assessment’ workshop.
- Development of four manuals for project beneficiaries and ToT trainers.
- Three days’ ToT training to prepare ToT Trainers to train the beneficiaries.
- Monitoring and evaluation of trainees training the beneficiaries.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The ToT trainers prepared by IRIM successfully completed the trainings for project beneficiaries on the topics of ‘Research Methodology’ and ‘Microsoft Excel’. The associated manuals have become a routine, daily resource for the civil servants.
CLIENT’S NAME

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the Study was to determine stakeholders’ willingness and capacity to engage in the UNDP’s Sustainable Cashmere Project (SCP) Concept. Subject to a positive result, stakeholders would be invited to participate in a new SCP project.
BACKGROUND

The WCS was considering inauguration of another SCP — in the Eastern Region of Mongolia — in cooperation with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). An existing SCP had already been underway in Omnogobi aimag (Gobi Region) since December 2015, and would be the basis for the latest (proposed) initiative, albeit in a new location. The proposed SCP was expected to create a sustainable and wildlife-friendly cashmere value chain among producers in Dornod and Khentii aimags of Eastern Region. The new project would collaborate with cooperatives, in areas to be selected from within the two targeted aimags.

PROJECT DESIGN

The Study fieldwork was based on the development of three questionnaires; initiated during the preceding Inception Phase. The questionnaires - revised by the Client in advance of the fieldwork — were targeted to three particular groups of respondents:

- Herders.
- Members of cooperatives, community-based organisations (CBOs), pasture user groups (PUGs).
- Staff of local government.

The herders’ questionnaire consisted of 43 (mainly closed-ended) questions; the other two, 28 and 23 (mainly open-ended) questions, respectively. Fieldwork related to the Study — involving the completion of questionnaires among herders, members of cooperatives and local government representatives — was conducted across 15 sub-district, 11 within Bayan-Uul and Tsagaan-Ovoo districts of Dornod aimag, and four within Norovlin district of Khentii aimag.
FINDINGS

Herders, groups (cooperatives, PUGs and CBOs) and local government representatives all expressed willingness to be involved in the SCP. They were aware of the potential benefits to the environment (especially for the status of the pasture) and were prepared to contribute (to the development to pasture management plans, for example). The herders interviewed were easily accessible; 56.8% had use of smart phones (even more with access to the Internet) and 76.8% were members of groups (of one sort or another). However, 23.2% of herders were not members of groups, though their other comments suggested they understood that to be successful, the SCP in general (and pasture management in particular) would depend upon unanimous involvement and engagement by all herders.
CLIENT’S NAME
The European Union - Economic Governance for Equitable Growth (EG4EG) Project - Mongolia.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the mission was to serve as an extension to the integrated risk-based management (IRBM) capacity-building work carried out in 2017 under the EG4EG project. Two missions were fielded in 2017 as part of the effort to support the Ministry of Finance (MoF) to strengthen the Mongolia Development Policy Planning Management Cycle. This was to be accomplished by reinforcing M&E functions required under Resolution 322/89 (dealing with monitoring and evaluation (M&E) functions related to the development programmes).

The extension mission was to strengthen the core functions and performance of the MoF, through the use of the strategic performance and M&E plan, consistent with the principles of the Integrated Results-Based Management (IRBM) system. The focus of the mission was to support the MoF to design and develop a set of strategic results-based performance and M&E plans, for different levels, that could be used by the Ministry to better manage its core functions and the role of the MoF.
BACKGROUND

The EG4EG project started in 2016, and was continued in early 2018, with a no-cost extension to July 2018. As a result, the IRBM assignment was also continued with a series of missions during the extension period. The 2018 IRBM assignment was carried out in three linked phases from March to June 2018.

The purpose of the assignment was to support the MoF, to strengthen the core functions and performance of respective departments, by exposing and building capacity on a cross-section of officials, through an Integrated Results-Based Management (IRBM) system.

ACTIVITIES

The assignment team was comprised of an international and national consultant, fielded in two separate missions, with an interim bridging period between them. The first mission was from 19 March to 6 April, and the second during 4 June to 29 June 2018.

The mission was conducted using an active engagement approach between the consulting team and key officials at three levels.

The Ministry’s department teams had already been provided with basic exposure training (on IRBM) during the 2017 missions. As such, the latest mission sessions focused more on practical design and development in the department, based on specific Strategic Performance Plan (D-SPP) documents.

Sessions were highly interactive, with brainstorming, discussions, and identification of performance issues. Meetings were used to review the contents of the SPP documents, and drafts prepared after discussion and agreement. The D-SPP contains key elements for a higher level strategic performance plan.

CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

As envisaged in the terms of reference of the extension project, the development of the strategic performance plans - and M&E plans - for the three levels of the MoF were deemed to be crucial. The project will strengthen the Ministry’s results-based management, through which it is hoped that the Ministry can improve its own results-based performance. But it will also help improve the budgetary and development results for the country. This will be especially critical if it is viewed from the budgetary and fiscal management functions by the Ministry of Finance.

The project has not only introduced the IRBM system to help move the Ministry to become more results-based oriented, but also introduced a key tool to support the results-based system, which is through the introduction of the Strategic Performance Plans and M&E Plans at both the Departmental and Ministry levels.
NEEDS ASSESSMENT SURVEY OF THE ‘PROMOTING INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOCUSING ON EVERY LAST CHILD IN MONGOLIA’ PROJECT

CLIENT’S NAME
Save the Children in Mongolia

SURVEY OBJECTIVES
Save the Children in Mongolia, in partnership with the Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Sports (MECSS), received funding from the Japanese Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) to implement a three-year project (March 2018 to March 2021) on ‘Promoting Inclusive Education Focusing on Every Last Child in Mongolia’. The project was to be implemented in the Bayanzurkh, Chingeltei, and Songinokhairkhan districts of Ulaanbaatar, and in Khovd and Uvurkhangai aimags.

The needs assessment survey was to generate an understanding of the current situation of regular schools and LifeLong Education Centres (LLECs). With attention to the implementation of inclusive education - its practice and development with respect to children with special needs (CWSN) - at the soum and aimag levels. Particular objectives included:

- Review the current situation of support for CWSN and the system for implementing inclusive education; in terms of teaching methods and evaluation system, required materials, and child-friendly spaces at regular schools in the project-targeted areas.
- Assess the current situation of the learning environment - along with learning materials and skills of staff who work for CWSN - in the LLECs and the outreach programs; available to out-of-school children in the project-targeted areas.
- Analyse the existing knowledge, capacity and understanding of teachers and school staff (on CWSN) at regular schools and LLECs.
BACKGROUND

In the 21st century, global trends in education have promoted the application of an inclusive education system for children with disabilities; into regular schools and general programs, rather than isolating them. ‘Inclusive education’ is to promote effective participation of people with disabilities in human society, by developing their intellectual and physical abilities to the highest level.

According to the National Statistical Office of Mongolia, the number of children not attending primary and secondary school had reached 10,311 in 2014. 1,169 of them are children who dropped out of school.

According to the 2010 data, primary education enrollment among children of the most vulnerable was 72%, but among those of wealthy families it was 93%. Access to education is closely tied to poverty, disability, health status, and home-based conditions such as negative attitude towards education by parents, and child labor in agriculture. Children of poor families cannot escape the poverty cycle as they are unable to secure a decent job, due to their inadequate education. Therefore, Save the Children in Mongolia initiated a project based on the need to support access to education for vulnerable children. To support the project, IRIM conducted a needs assessment to understand the current situation of education organizations (regular schools and LLEC) in terms of the implementation of inclusive education (its practice and development with respect to CWSN among the target groups).

PROJECT DESIGN

The survey covered 658 respondents, including: teachers, school managers, parents, khoroo and kindergarten specialists, aimag and soum education division specialists, the MECSS, Institute of Education, teacher training institutes, and specialists of the relevant public authorities. Six hundred and thirty questionnaires were duly completed, 43 key informant interviews, four in-depth interviews, and ten case studies.
FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Teachers at regular schools had conflicting views on educating CWSN at regular schools. One in two teachers agreed that CWSN have right to be educated in regular schools but it is more beneficial for them to study at special schools in terms of academic success. They also ruled out the possibility of educating children with following three conditions at regular schools, ‘Intellectual disability’, ‘Autism spectrum disorder’ (ASD) and ‘Epileptic children’. It can be concluded that, above mentioned ambiguous and conflicting views by teachers have been caused by the absence of appropriate educational conditions for CWSN.

Respondents highlighted the following problems educating CWSN in regular schools.

Most challenging problems that school faced for education of CWSN. (by the response of the regular school teachers)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>№</th>
<th>Constraints</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Methodologies, modules and programs of educating CWSN is not adequate</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>81.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Teachers’ lack of knowledge, abilities and experience in working with CWSN</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>70.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Parents (without CWSN) understanding of CWSN is not adequate</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>62.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Negative attitude of teachers and staff working with CWSN</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>62.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Inadequacy of education materials, tools and facilities needed for working with CWSN</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>50.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Systematic actions used in assessing CWSN are limited</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>School authorities lack interest in receiving CWSN at their schools</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>41.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Special education teachers’ professional development at work is weak</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>40.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Special education implementation environment is not sufficiently ensured</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Infrastructure of the schools are not well developed to receive CWSN</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The survey revealed that 88% of teachers, in regular schools, were not adequately prepared to work with CWSN. Teachers need to be trained for using screening and assessing methodology CWSN (and different categories of disabilities) and training to work with CWSN.
DEVELOPMENT OF AN INSTRUMENT FOR COUNTRY PORTFOLIO REVIEWS FOR GERMAN DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION: A CASE STUDY IN MONGOLIA – NATIONAL CONSULTANCY

CLIENT’S NAME
DEval (Deutsches Evaluierungsinstitut der Entwicklungszusammenarbeit - The German Institute for Development Evaluation)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective was to support the review team of DEval, in their case study of Mongolia; which aimed to develop and test an instrument for the Country Portfolio Review of German Development Cooperation.
BACKGROUND

The German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) aims to support sustainable development through an organizational triad consisting of country strategies, programs and projects. As noted in the peer review of Germany published by the Development Assistance Committee of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD-DAC) in 2015, result-based management continues to face challenges. The BMZ has responded to these challenges and taken steps to strengthen the evidence-based strategic portfolio management of bilateral development cooperation. In this context, DEval, supported the BMZ with regard to developing an instrument for Country Portfolio Reviews (CPRs). DEval and BMZ agreed on Mongolia, as the country for a case study to develop this new instrument for CPR.

IRIM helped the DEval team in understanding the country context and assisted in answering the following main questions:

- What does the current context of the partner country look like and what are important development trends over the next few years?
- Which policy priorities does the partner government pursue and how does it address key development trends?
- What roles do civic and economic actors play with regard to development trends in the partner country?
- To what extent do development partners address key development priorities, and which strategies do they pursue?

The DEval review team visited Mongolia during 18 June to 29 June and (together with IRIM) conducted consultation meetings and workshops with various stakeholders. The IRIM team also supported the DEval review team’s efforts to assess the local political and economic situation, by providing political analyses and briefings on different sectorial situations.

CONCLUSIONS FUTURE DIRECTIONS

DEval will publish the overall report on the ‘Development of an instrument for strategic portfolio analysis for German development cooperation’ in the first half of 2019.
CLIENT’S NAME
Transparency International (TI) Mongolia.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
Business Integrity Country Agenda (BICA) Mongolia is the country’s first comprehensive analysis of contributions made by all stakeholders - to transparency, integrity and accountability - in the corporate sector. The report aims to identify the contributions and shortcomings of the business sector, public institutions and civil society, that play major roles in the fight against corruption. The analysis aims to strengthen all stakeholders by establishing a comprehensive reform agenda, through active engagement in advocacy activities.
BACKGROUND

In many countries, there is no comprehensive assessment framework targeted at reducing corruption in the private sector. In 2016, Transparency International Global worked to address this gap, through implementing BICA, to improve integrity in the private sector. Alongside Cambodia, Italy, Mozambique and Turkey, Mongolia has been working in the BICA project in 2018.

PROJECT DESIGN

The BICA program considered each country’s public sector, private sector and civil society with 15 thematic areas, 51 indicators and 139 questions and developed general evaluation on the three sectors. The special feature of the study is that the countries around the world are not compared. In accordance with this methodology, we established The National Advisory Group (NAG) for the Mongolian BICA consisted of 10 members drawn from the major stakeholder groups, complemented by other national and international experts. The main areas of responsibility of the NAG during the BICA assessment were:

- To review the assessment framework and propose adaptations to reflect the national context
- To assist the external researchers in data collection and verification
- To review and validate the scoring of indicators
- To propose recommendations for relevant stakeholders groups
- To support the dissemination of assessment results after publication

Data for this research was primarily obtained through desk research, supplemented by interviews with experts from all three sectors.
FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Recommendations in the three sectors were developed - in accordance with the findings of the research – as follow:

PUBLIC SECTOR

- **New laws**: Mongolia lacks a whistleblower protection law on corruption. For example, a law on whistleblowing or law or regulation of lobbying;

- **Legal amendments**:
  - Introduce a regulation on direct commission into the general provision of ‘receiving of a bribe’.
  - The Law on Anti-Corruption should enact a provision on ‘Prohibiting the downsizing of the budget of the IAAC’; the same recommendation for the Law on Judiciary, for the judiciary budget.
  - The statutes of limitation should be increased in the Law on Anti-Corruption and Law on Competition (offenses).
  - More precise definitions of horizontal and vertical cartels and anti-competitive agreements should be added to the Law on Competition.
  - More precise qualitative characteristics on dominant position should be added to the
Law on Competition.
- Proper procedures to remove immunities of public officials are required.
- Political parties with parliamentary seats should be included in the Law on Glass Accounts.
- There should be a provision for a ‘cooling-off’ period for corporate executives prior to assuming senior public offices and/or governmental posts.
- The Public Procurement Law should reflect provisions for favorable procurement conditions for companies with effective anti-corruption programs.
- The department system in public procurement should be intensified.

- Improvement of institutional independence, authority:
  - The independence of the Independent Agency against Corruption, the Authority for Fair Competition and Consumer Protection, the Judiciary, and the Mongolian National Audit Office should be strengthened.
  - The monitoring and reporting system for pre and post-election financing of political parties should be improved.
  - There should be an increase in the transparency, and decrease in the bureaucracy of the State Specialized Inspection Agency, with the transfer of services (where feasible) to e-format.

- Improvement of institutional capacity:
  - The stability of the management and human resources of the Independent Agency against Corruption and the Authority for Fair Competition and Consumer Protection should be assured.
  - The Independent Agency against Corruption; the Authority for Fair Competition and Consumer Protection, the Financial Regulatory Commission, the Bank of Mongolia, and the Financial Crimes Unit of National Police Agency should all focus on investigation and legal assistance with foreign law enforcement authorities.

- Improvement in law enforcement:
  - Implementation of the two-year ‘cooling-off’ period provision for public officials should be enhanced.
  - The organizational authority and responsibility for monitoring party financing and financial statements should be more clearly defined.
  - There should be centralization of public procurement for improved monitoring.
  - Requirements for transparency of company ownership structure and beneficial ownership should be reflected in tender materials.
  - The remuneration system for procurement positions should be clearly defined.

- Improvement of information transparency:
  - The Judicial General Council of Mongolia, the State General Prosecutor’s Office of Mongolia and other affiliated organizations should reflect statistics and indicators on corruption in their reports: for example, the workload of inspectors on corruption cases.
  - The reports of the Mongolian Tax Administration and Customs General Administration of Mongolia should reflect statistics and indicators on corruption.
  - The full financial report of an election should be publicly disclosed in a timely manner.

PRIVATE SECTOR

- Legal amendments: (i)
  - A regulation should be added to the Company Law to disclose beneficial ownership.
  - BODs should be mandated to monitor the company’s anti-corruption policies and programs.
  - Establish monitoring mechanisms to hold accountable companies certified in corporate governance;

- Support of business integrity:
  - There should be intensification of
requirements for anti-corruption programs, policies and procedures for members of Mongolian National Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Stock Exchange of Mongolia, Financial Regulatory Commission of Mongolia and professional business associations.

- Broader anti-corruption concepts on ‘corporate governance’ should be reflected in trainings approved by the Financial Regulatory Commission of Mongolia.

CIVIL SOCIETY

- Legal amendments:
  - Sanctions for slander in the law on Administrative Offences should be amended.
  - There should be regulations to prevent media concentrations and monopolies.
  - There should be regulations to ensure disclosure of media ownership.
  - Regulations are needed to ensure financial transparency of the media.

- Support of business integrity:
  - Civil society should support business integrity at all levels.
  - Civil society capacity-building in monitoring the private sector should be enhanced.
  - The quality of civil society participation in public procurement should be improved.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Based on the findings of the survey TI, the National Advisory Group and other stakeholders are working to approve and implement the Mongolian National Program.
CLIENT'S NAME
Governor’s Office of the Capital City and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the consultancy service was to develop Public Private Partnership (PPP) policy and regulation for the Capital City.
BACKGROUND

There was an obvious demand for identifying obstacles to implementing the PPP policy and its goals in the Capital City, and selecting the projects to be developed in line with the priorities of development policies and stakeholders’ capabilities. At the time, there was a lack of policies and regulations related to running PPP projects within the Capital City. Also, stakeholders’ duties and participation were unclear and there was a lack of integration of activities, due to the lack of cooperation among stakeholders in charge of PPP projects. There was also a lack of common understanding among stakeholders. These issues indicated there was demand for developing policy and regulations on PPPs in the Capital City, and empowering stakeholders working in PPPs.

PROJECT DESIGN

To develop the PPPs’ policy and regulation within the Capital City, and the following activities were conducted:

• Situational analysis:
  o Analysis of existing institutional structures, management, and regulations managing PPP projects.
  o Study of opportunities to expand the PPP initiatives by reviewing the existing potential, and development of recommendations.

• Development of relevant documents:
  o Development of draft regulation documents on: managing PPP projects at the municipal level (including requirements for selecting PPP projects), guidelines for identifying priority projects to be funded, and guidelines for conducting feasibility studies and assessments.

• Empowerment of human resources:
  o Improvement of the perception of PPPs.
  o Organisation of training on successful implementation of PPP projects.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The situational analysis (on legal documents), current organizational structure, regulations and PPP projects was completed. Discussions were conducted among the main stakeholders, including: the Governor’s Office of the Capital City, Ulaanbaatar Development Corporation JSC and Ulaanbaatar Department of Industry and Innovation. Issues (constraints and solutions) related to implementation of PPP projects were identified. In the discussions, stakeholders were agreed on following:

• There was a range of perceptions related to PPPs; due in some cases to a lack of mutual understanding among relevant stakeholders and those engaged in managing and reviewing PPP projects.
• The selection process for approval of PPP projects was vague, due to a lack of guidance and regulation on selecting and ranking projects.
• The quality of the projects and their performances was poor; due in part to the skipping of feasibility studies and other relevant analyses.

Using the situational analysis findings, policy on PPPs in the Capital City - and their regulation - were developed. Feedback and comments were reflected in the draft policy and regulations. Training topics (including the concepts of PPP, international practices and identification of priority projects) were delivered to the implementing agencies of the Capital city and the main stakeholders (including the Governor’s
Office of the Capital City, Ulaanbaatar Development Corporation JSC and Ulaanbaatar Department of Industry and Innovation) through 2 days of training. The trainings were about:

- Introduction to PPP projects
- Guidance on ranking and selecting the PPP projects
- Conducting feasibility study of the PPP
- Managing and reviewing the PPP projects successfully.

The initiatives, policies and procedures developed during the consultation process were integrated. The following documents were submitted to the client:

- Situation analysis on PPPs at the municipal level.
- Training documents for municipal officers in change of PPPs.
- A draft municipal-level policy on PPPs.

The Governor’s Office of the Capital City was to be responsible for approval of all documents developed within scope of the project.
THE END-LINE SURVEY FOR THE “WOMEN’S BUSINESS CENTER” PROJECT

CLIENT’S NAME
The Asian Foundation (TAF)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The main purpose of the End-line Survey was to evaluate the WBC project’s implementation and its overall impact on women’s empowerment.
BACKGROUND

Small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) and micro-business represent about 95% of all enterprises in Mongolia (of which about 80% are microenterprises), and they are mainly in the trade, agriculture and community, and social services sectors. SMEs contribute about 25% of GDP and employ roughly half of the total workforce\(^1\). In addition, as of the second quarter of 2018, 86% of all enterprises had less than nine employees (11% higher than the previous year) and 66% of were located in Ulaanbaatar city\(^2\).

The Government of Mongolia (GoM) has evolved policies, institutional frameworks and support mechanisms for small businesses and gender equality. Various bilateral and multilateral development and donor organizations have also implemented inventions to improve institutional frameworks, increase women’s economic opportunities and strengthen women’s capacity to act in the business sector.

Furthermore, some concerns arise from a lack of capability for micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs), namely:

- Lack of management skills and self-confidence;
- Poor implementation;
- Lack of market intelligence;
- Shortage of working capital;
- Lack of networking;
- Labor-force issues;

Under these circumstances, it is crucial to support women-owned enterprises by addressing their specific needs, which are: business enabling environment, promotion of entrepreneurial culture, financing, business development services, innovation and technology development, adaptation and market access.

\(^1\) (Millennium Challenge Corporation, 2016).
\(^2\) National Statistical Office.

In June 2017, the WBC opened a new business incubator (BI) to increase women’s contribution to the Ulaanbaatar economy by providing women entrepreneurs with access to state-of-the-art facilities.

PROJECT DESIGN

To do this survey, quantitative and qualitative data were captured through a desk study of relevant documents and a survey of a representative sample of WBC’s beneficiaries, which was incorporated with the findings from a focus group discussion (FGD) of BI’s beneficiaries.

The End-line survey consisted of following three steps:

1) IRIM team reviewed relevant documents and reports in order to design survey tools

2) **Questionnaire**: It consists of six sections. The first two sections are related to demographics and the current business situation of woman entrepreneurs. The third section focuses on how participants have participated in the activities provided by the WBC. The fourth section aims to evaluate the change in knowledge and attitude of beneficiaries as participating in the activities of the WBC. The fifth section focuses on how their businesses have changed as a result of the WBC project. The final section is participants’ satisfaction with the WBC project.

The sampling size for the questionnaire was 200 participants. They were randomly sample selected from the 791 registered entrepreneurs who have already started their own business. 5% of the sample size, or around 10 participants, were women entrepreneurs with a disability.
3) **Focus Group Discussion (FGD):** In order to collect more qualitative information about the BI program, the BI graduates were invited to the focus group discussions. The BI graduates who were involved in the focus group discussions gave valuable information about the quality of the BI activities, effectiveness of the program and future needs of the program continuity. A total 24 BI graduates representing 4 different cohorts was involved in the focus group discussions.

**FINDINGS**

The WBC project has contributed to building an enabling environment for women who have created and started a business but lacked sufficient support for the business to reach its full potential. Notably, the women who were involved in the WBC project, benefitted from improved business related knowledge and skills, connecting to the market, expanding their network and collaboration abilities, and importantly, making an economic contribution to their families, communities, and the urban economy as a whole.

It is evident from the end-line survey result that the number of legally registered, taxpaying business, increased from 40% to 61% as compared to the baseline study. Also, the number of women running very micro businesses (revenues of MNT 10-50 million) increased as compared to the baseline.

The beneficiaries of the WBC project are satisfied with their registration and participation in the project.

![Figure 1. Business income change](image)

![Figure 2. Evaluation of the importance of WBC activities](image)

Most of the women-owned businesses highly rated the training and advisory services available to them through the project. The most satisfied participants are the businesswomen who graduated from the Business Incubator program. They saw the WBC project and BI program’s approach was very innovative, needs-based, and an efficient means of support received as compared with the government approaches to small business support. In other words, the project chosen the theory of change, implementation methodology and performance quality were well received by their targeted beneficiaries.

Another key aspect of the project is that women business owners are getting strong awareness of
their potential for economic empowerment, which enables women to take on a more leading role in a business and their wider communities. Due to the nature of the BI program’s participatory and collaborative approach, women have learned the importance of learning from each other and sharing knowledge, positive attitudes and enabling behavior challenge. The WBC helped the women participants build a strong foundation for business creation, therefore, the project has achieved its initial purpose.

**Figure 3. Evaluation of Changes in Knowledge after Attending WBC Training**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge Area</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Innovation and packaging</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making agreement</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using social media</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation and public speaking</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Team working</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial planning and recording</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production development</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing customer</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business planning</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales strategy</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Amongst participants from the BI program, there was a sense that the project, in its next phases, needs to support the current micro businesses to scale up, not just in terms of financial scale but more related to business management after setting up the business. Some practical suggestions provided by the participants are collaboration with the district and city level micro & SME development agencies; advocate and network amongst the national larger supermarkets to accept to display the micro business products on their shelves; ongoing and increased advanced level training and consultation activities; and more flexible sources of finance (for capital and operating expenses) based on evaluating businesswomen’s financial history and social profiles, and giving them trust.

**FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

Second stage of the project is going to be continued from December 2018 to September 2020. And they are working on developing their project based on our recommendations.
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON DEMOCRACY IN THE 21ST CENTURY: CHALLENGES AND THE WAYS FORWARD

CLIENT’S NAME
World Society Foundation (WSF)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the Conference was to provide an academic environment - for scholars from around the world - to engage and discuss the status of democracy. It was to examine perspectives and current debates in democracy, and gauge ongoing changes in democratic processes; in Asia in particular, and globally in general.
BACKGROUND

World leaders reaffirmed at the 2005 World Summit that ‘democracy is a universal value, based on freely expressed will of people to determine their own political, economic, social and cultural systems and their participation in all aspects of their lives’. However, values of democracy and human rights are different in every region. In Europe and America democracy is highly valued, while in Africa and Central Asia it is less valued. Although developed countries set examples, and exhibit good practices of democracy, they also show signs of back-pull, as in recent cases of the USA’s presidential election and Great Britain’s ‘Brexit’ proposal to leave EU. Since 1990, Mongolia has embraced multi-party parliamentarian democracy and is seen as one of the most successful democratic transitions in Central Asia. It is often referred as the ‘Island of Democracy’ and it was, indeed, very appropriate to organize the Conference in Ulaanbaatar, the capital city.

GEOGRAPHICAL SCOPE

Participants: Turkey, Canada, Austria, Malaysia, Kyrgyzstan, Spain, Germany, Belgium, USA, Kazakhstan, India, Laos.

PROCEEDINGS

The Conference took place on 9 and 10 July, and was preceded by a Welcome Day and followed by a Cultural Day. The Conference brought together 94 participants, of whom one-third were international scholars (from 12 different countries) and the remaining were Mongolian participants interested in the topic of democracy. The participants came from diverse backgrounds, and represented a variety of organizations, including: universities, non-governmental organizations, media, donor organizations and government.

A total of 32 presentations were delivered during the Conference - from national and international scholars, practitioners and government officials — along with three keynote speeches from prominent academics working in the field of democracy. The Conference was opened with speeches delivered by the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, the Deputy Minister of Justice and Home Affairs and the Ambassador of Switzerland; all of whom noted the importance and timeliness of the Conference.

Significant attention was devoted to the Conference by the media, including journalists from Mongolia’s major television channels. Highlights and proceedings of the Conference were regularly shared on social media – Facebook and Twitter - allowing participants to engage live with each other.

The Conference was unique as it provided travel grants for Mongolian scholars living abroad; many of whom would be otherwise unable to attend such events organized in their home country. The Conference’s support provided opportunities for national and international scholars to exchange knowledge among and between themselves.

The Conference was a platform for exchange, built on the understanding that democracy is key to building sustainable societies which contribute to people’s well-being, and peace. Discussions centred on:

• The role of civil society to contribute to good governance and promote democracy.
• Global and national cleavages between rural and urban populations regarding democracy.
• Constraints and opportunities that the extractive industry brings to emerging democracies such as Mongolia.

Key topics of the Conference included:

**Urban-rural cleavages and democracy.** Related papers included: impacts of rural-urban cleavages on democratic processes and foundations, political differences between rural and urban areas in Asia, freedom of information, human rights and gender in rural-urban settings, voter behaviour, political parties and the electoral system, and social cohesion in rural and urban areas and democracy.

**Civil society and democracy.** Related papers included: role of civil society in democratic governance, role of civil society in promoting democracy and good governance, citizen participation and public confidence, and the role of civil society in democratic consolidation in Asia.

**Extractive economics, resources-rich countries and democracy.** Related papers included: governance transparency and accountability (corruption), how democracy works in a resource-based global economic system, the relationships between natural resources, democracy and corruption, democratic governance and multinational corporations, and political regimes and inflows of foreign direct investment.

**PUBLICATIONS**

Given the importance of the Conference, some of the presentations will be published in the *World Society Studies* and translated into Mongolian for the occasion of the thirtieth anniversary of the Democratic Movement in Mongolia. The editorial board selected 12 papers from the Conference to be published. It is hoped that the Conference will have an impact beyond its direct participants and reach a wider audience — young and senior scholars, journalists, NGO practitioners and public officials interested in the topic of democracy.

**CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

Firstly, a proposal to continue organizing the Conference - annually or bi-annually - was raised by participants. Each conference could focus on more specific aspects of democracy, and the participation could be broader, with opportunities for exchange between Mongolian scholars (living abroad or at home) and international participants.

Secondly, topics of future collaborative research were suggested by participants, such as: looking at the compatibility between natural resources and democracy, comparative research on foreign aid (state elites and democracy), the locality of democratic governance, comparative studies centred around civic society (education and democracy), social media (digital society and democracy), and the rise of autocratic states and democracy.

Thirdly, proposals to implement advocacy projects to advance awareness of democracy were discussed.

Overall, the Conference was successful in terms of encouraging interest in collaboration between the participants, and igniting interesting discussion and examination of the state of democracy in the 21st Century.

All Conference information and presentations can be accessed online at [http://irim.mn/1180](http://irim.mn/1180)
MONITORING AND EVALUATION
STUDY ON TRACKING COMMUNITY
BEHAVIOR CHANGES RESULTING FROM
TRAINING ON ‘MINING AND WATER
MANAGEMENT IN THE SOUTH GOBI’
AND ‘WATER MONITORING’ MODULES

CLIENT’S NAME
International Finance Corporation (IFC)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The main objective was to assess, measure and record, changes in knowledge, practices and behaviors among the participants of ‘Mining and Water Management in the South Gobi’ and ‘Water Monitoring’ training; comparing difference between ‘target’ and ‘control’ groups. Particular objectives included attention to the following:

- Knowledge and awareness of groundwater and hydrogeology, and the monitoring of water quality and quantity.
- Assessment of water risks and management opportunities.
- Responses to risks through changing practices.
- Adoption of new behaviors (on water usage) and initiatives (on the implementation of sustainable water management programs).
BACKGROUND

The IFC - a member of the World Bank Group - has been implementing project activities focused on:

- Improving mining companies’ water management practices.
- Strengthening companies’ relationships with local communities.
- Educating community, government and industry stakeholders on mining and water issues.

The ‘Mining and Water Management in the South Gobi’ and ‘Water Monitoring’ training modules were initiated in 2014; and 750 people throughout the 12 soums of Umnugobi aimag have participated. The objectives of the training included:

- Increase stakeholders’ knowledge.
- Demonstrate mining companies’ water management practices.

GEOGRAPHICAL SCOPE

Data collection was conducted in 15 soums of Umnugobi province.

PROJECT DESIGN

Due to the absence of a baseline assessment for training activities, prior to the intervention, comparisons of ‘target’ and ‘control’ groups were used in developing the evaluation of outcomes. People that had participated in the training were referred to as the ‘target’ group, whereas people that had not received any training were referred to as the ‘control’ group. In measuring participants’ knowledge (practices and behavior), questions were designed following the four expected levels of adoption.

To measure participants’ knowledge – within adoption level 1 – the questionnaire used some of the questions from the training quiz that was used before and after the original training. In determining levels of adoption 2 to 4, questions were prepared using indicators given in the terms of the reference. Ultimately, 996 respondents (367 ‘target’ and 629 ‘control’) were questioned, and another 38 participated in key informant interviews.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

1. Relevance

The ‘Groundwater Management and Monitoring’ training module was relevant and matched the needs identified in the Public Perception Survey on Water in Omnogobi in 2013. Even today the training topics are valid for improving water management practices; among community residents, mining companies and government authorities. However, involvement of the most active and critical group - herders - was insufficient. Most training participants were soum center residents, so the original training’s targeting and coverage were not fully appropriate. All three stakeholder groups agreed that some part of the training content was at an advanced level, too theoretical and too hard to apply in practice (even though trainers used
some innovative methods and tools).

2. Effectiveness and Good Behavior Changes

Overall, the training resulted in the positive behavior changes among all three stakeholders. It was evident when comparing ‘target’ and ‘control’ groups, that there was increased knowledge and awareness among the ‘target’ population. However, the degree of effective adoption was different between the groups. The highest level of behavior changes occurred among the mining stakeholders; followed by community members that exhibited slightly higher positive changes than local government stakeholders. The training modules initially proposed 28 indicators, and the Study revealed that 20 (71.4%) showed change; and the situation had improved - directly and indirectly – by impacts from the training.

The Study identified some positive changes also attributable to respondent companies adoption of the Voluntary Code of Practice (VCP) of 2014. Through the VCP, they initiated water management activities in their operating areas. This might have affected in the positive changes, other than the training itself.

**Level 1.** People who had participated in the training were generally more knowledgeable than those who had not; and those who were already more knowledgeable gained even more from the training (with mining staff gaining a 24.1 percentage point increase, in contrast to just 11.5 among members of the public).

\[Level 1\]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Government</th>
<th>Mining</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Target</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>43.4</td>
<td>57.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[Level 2.\] ‘Assessment of Water Risks and Management Opportunity’ was assessed by six indicators, and five (83.0%) were improved. ‘Target’ groups had, for example, requested meetings with relevant stakeholders (regarding their assessed water risks); more than 29 percentage points greater than among the ‘control’ group. It was observed that members of the Community still had reduced levels of trust - in information from the mining companies – as they did in the *Perception Survey* conducted in 2013.

**Level 3.** ‘Respond to Risk’ was assessed by eight indicators, of which five (62.5%) were improved and three (37.5%) showed no change. For community members, motivation (to respond) prompted by the training was reinforced by their developing needs for water. For example, herdies were more active responders and were involved in water management activities, because water needs were especially important for their livelihoods.

**Level 4.** ‘Sustainability of Water Management Programs’ was assessed by eleven indicators, of which seven (63.0%) were improved and four (37.0%) unchanged.

**Potential for Replication**

There are clear needs for the training to be continued; more targeted to the herdies, with tailored training content and using proper approaches to delivery. It was recommended that the training should be repeated (after being updated and improved) with the following changes:

- More focus on households with livestock.
- More content on how to decrease and resolve the water-related risks and disputes.
- More content on how to use water efficiency; increasing awareness at each level.
- Mining companies to use more techniques and methods, which consume less water; and disseminate information about changing practices.
- More content about how community members (herdies) can increase livestock quality and contribute to sustainability.
PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The purpose of the assignment was to complete a socio-economic baseline study of the forest-steppe dependent community in the Local Protected Area (LPA) of Bulgan soum (Arkhangai aimag). The Study focused on the existing state of livelihoods in the community, overall economic well-being, pastureland degradation, and issues related to the wildlife and forests.
BACKGROUND

ZSL has been implementing the ‘Steppe-up; Community-led recovery of Mongolia’s iconic species and forest-steppe ecosystem’ project - from July 2018 to March 2021 - in Arkhangai aimag. The main objective of the project is to establish a local protected area (LPA) to promote socio-ecological resilience to support the following:

- focal species recovery,
- sustainable forest management,
- sustainable pasture management,
- sustainable and equitable livelihoods, and
- effective LPA governance, monitoring and evaluation.

PROJECT DESIGN

To accomplish the Study, both qualitative and quantitative methods were used and the following activities undertaken:

1) Questionnaires were prepared to collect socio-economic data from among households of the LPA in Bulgan soum. Using the collected data, the study team conducted analyses; to determine the current status of livelihoods within the community, and to estimate the overall economic well-being. The latter was evaluated using the multidimensional poverty index (MPI) in conjunction with analysis of residents’ employment, housing conditions and infrastructure, and life satisfaction.

2) Focus group discussions (FGDs) were...
conducted within three groups: local leaders and experts, local people living in the LPA, and women living in the LPA. Participatory methods used, included: natural resource mapping, threat analysis (changes/impacts/threats, and causes/drivers), and changes and trends (for all natural resources and species).

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The following results were revealed.

- The livelihoods of local people living in the LPA were predominantly livestock-based (91% were herders). The main income was from selling dairy products, wool and meat. There was good scope to increase income through value-added, locally made products. However, due to increases in livestock numbers and mismanagement, the pastureland had deteriorated significantly.

- Households in the LPA were not poor - as each owns sufficient livestock - but the MPI indicators showed the living standards of local people would be classified as ‘deprived’. However, representatives of more than half of the randomly sampled households indicated they were ‘satisfied’ with their lives.

- With respect to people’s education, they were not particularly vulnerable, as a majority of adults had completed high school and secondary education. However, there were comparatively high numbers of young men in households (aged 18-39 years) with only primary education, or no education at all. As in other areas of Mongolia, local women were more highly educated than men, but their decision-making roles - in the community and within soum planning - were debatable.

- In terms of their health, people in the LPA were not particularly vulnerable. But, most of the Study respondents were considered ‘overweight’ due to their inadequate diet.
The local forest was being degraded; due to illegal logging and irregular rehabilitation activities. A couple of forest user groups (FUGs) were attempting to undertake community conservation activities; such as: re-forestation and thinning.

Such institutions need strengthening to make substantial contributions to the management forest resources. Local people’s knowledge and awareness about wildlife was inadequate to undertake conservation activities.
ACTION PLAN FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STATE POLICY ON HEALTH DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

CLIENT’S NAME
The Ministry of Health (MoH)
Asian Development Bank (ADB)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The main objective was to develop an action plan for the State Policy on Health (SPH), which is accompanied by five supporting documents, including:

- Essential and Complimentary Package of Services.
- Medium-term Expenditure Framework.
- Medium-term Investment Plan (with recommended procurement processes).
- Service Planning Framework.
- Monitoring and Evaluation Framework.
BACKGROUND

The Government of Mongolia requested technical assistance from the ADB to support its effort in preparing a Health Sector Master Plan in the form of an Action Plan for the Implementation of the State Policy on Health (2019-2026). ADB obtained financial support from the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction (JFPR) to respond to the request. The proposed technical assistance - developing a strategic framework through 2026 - would contribute to strengthening institutional and human resource capacity of the MoH. This should enable the MoH to pursue its long-term development policy on health; consistent with Mongolia’s commitments to health-related targets under the Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030.

PROJECT DESIGN

As a part of the development of the Action Plan for the SPH and its five supporting documents, different methodologies are to be employed. A learning-by-doing and competence-based, task analysis approach is planned to be used in the areas of: health care planning, financial planning, impact assessment of health interventions, health technology assessment, health needs assessment, investment and capital planning, monitoring and evaluation of health programs, and development partner and aid coordination in the sector.

FINDINGS

Deliverables and outputs – to be produced by the consultancy team of five national and three international experts - include seven major reports; each of which contain information about specific activities undertaken in the project. Since the commencement of the project the deliverables produced, and consultative meetings organized under the development of the strategies and actions plans of the SPH, were as follows:

Deliverables:

Consultative meetings organized
- Launching meeting; 15 June 2018.
- Regional meeting 1; 17-28 September 2018.
- MoH departments and divisions meetings; 27 November to 7 December, 2018.
- Coordinating Committee Meeting; 13 February 2019.
- Regional meeting 2- 11 to 15 March 2019.

Planned activities, and pending outcomes and deliverables
- Technical Report 3
- Technical Report 4
  - Medium-term Expenditure Framework.
  - Medium-term Investment Plan and the Procurement Processes.
  - Service Planning Framework.
  - Monitoring and Evaluation Framework.
- Final Policy Implementation Strategies (2019-2027) documents
  - Essential and Complimentary Package of Services.
- Medium-term Expenditure Framework.
- Medium-term Investment Plan with recommended procurement processes.
- Service Planning Framework.
- Monitoring and Evaluation Framework.
- Project Completion Report
  - Implementation of the Capacity Building Program.
- Implementation of the stakeholders’ consultation and coordination mechanisms.

**Consultative Meetings**
- Regional Meeting; one.
- National Meeting; three.
- Technical Working Group meeting; five.
- Coordinating Committee meeting; three.
GOBI FRAMEWORK FOR SUSTAINABLE INFRASTRUCTURE PARTNERSHIPS: SCALING UP PRAXIS FROM MONGOLIA TO CENTRAL ASIA

CLIENT'S NAME
University of Oxford
Funded by UK’s Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) and Global Challenges Research Fund (GCRF)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The main objective is to develop a framework for sustainable infrastructure development in order to promote inclusive economic development and social welfare in the context of Chinese mega infrastructure initiatives in Mongolia, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan.

The aims of this research are:

1. To develop an innovative mediation framework for sustainable infrastructure development that builds on expertise and praxis from Mongolia’s mining sector and is scalable and replicable across Chinese ‘Belt and Road Initiative’ infrastructure projects in Central Asia and beyond.
2. To address the challenge of building relationships of trust, cooperation and transparency between key stakeholders in infrastructure development projects, ensuring that socio-economically marginalized communities and local governance institutions are included as partners in the instigation and implementation of large-scale, foreign-backed infrastructure projects which directly affect their livelihoods, environments and access to land and resources.
3. To enhance the capacity of communities and government to maximize economic advantages and minimize negative impacts of major infrastructure projects through robust institutional frameworks for mediation.
BACKGROUND

While large-scale infrastructure projects represent a key mechanism of economic growth and development, they also bring unintended and negative consequences to local populations and environments. Common challenges include:

- Lack of engagement with local communities and local government.
- Breakdown in social cohesion due to competition for resources.
- Inequitable economic growth.
- Pressures on weak governance structures and institutional capacity.
- Detrimental impacts on environment sustainability.
- Conflicts between stakeholders which can lead to sub-optimal economic growth outcomes.

These generic challenges can be compounded by specific regional and geographic factors. This project examines these challenges in the context of Chinese backed infrastructure megaprojects across Asia.

PROJECT DESIGN

The project explores ways to develop responsive, transparent and effective governance institutions at a range of scales, whereby different stakeholders can mediate disputes and ensure that development is sustainable and inclusive. IRIM undertook research within a multi-stakeholder engagement framework - within Umnugovi’s Khan Bogd soum - to understand how disputes were resolved in this case. This research will inform the development of the Gobi Framework for Sustainable Infrastructure Partnerships. This framework will then be trialled in sites in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan.

In addition to academic publications, the project will develop a handbook and phone app which can be utilized by a range of stakeholders. Over the course of 2018-2021, IRIM will be holding consultation sessions and knowledge exchanges in order to develop these tools.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The research is currently underway, so no results or conclusions are currently available.
CLIENT'S NAME
United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the Review was to generate a body of knowledge to guide national evaluation capacity development for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Specifically, it would: showcase successes (lessons and learnings) from the national evaluation system, foster peer-to-peer learning among stakeholders, and inform regional and national evaluation capacity development guidance through the production of readiness assessments at the country level.

The Mongolian case study was one of several, serving as inputs to the Asia and Pacific regional synthesis report, that brings together key findings and recommendations relevant to national evaluation capacity development needs in the region.

By adopting a consultative approach, that engages key stakeholders, the review process sought to build interest and capacity, in relation to evaluation for the 2030 Agenda (amongst national and regional evaluation stakeholders). The Review’s findings, might also serve as useful input to the voluntary national review for the High Level Political Forum (HLPF).
BACKGROUND

In September 2015, governments across the world adopted the 2030 Agenda for SDGs; a global plan of action for people, planet, and prosperity of the nations. This monitoring framework captures universal aspirations across three dimensions of sustainable development: economic development, social development, and environmental protection.

To support the SDGs’ implementation, many countries have developed institutional arrangements to promote coordination across sectors and government levels. This would facilitate the analysis of alignment of development plans and budgets with SDG targets, and assessment of the availability of data and capacities of data systems to monitor and evaluate the progress. But efforts need to go beyond measurement, to consider whether progress was equitable, relevant and sustainable.

Mongolia has committed to implementing the 2030 Agenda - through a collaborative partnership with all stakeholders - to address poverty and inequalities. To this end Mongolia’s Sustainable Development Vision 2030 was approved by the country’s parliament on 5 February, 2016.

As of 2017, 162 policy documents - at the national and local level - were being adopted; including many competing strategies, policies and programs. These were linked — somewhat inconsistently - to the country’s long term development vision, and lacked sufficient resource allocations and monitoring mechanisms to track their performance.

In this context, developing and strengthening national capacities for evaluation, needed to be addressed as an integral part of the overall mainstreaming and implementation of the 2030 Agenda.
**PROJECT DESIGN**

The country case study in Mongolia would:

- Develop comprehensively map and analyze key features of the national evaluation systems, and related capacities.
- Describe and analyze national responses to the evaluation requirements of the 2030 Agenda.
- Identify successes (and lessons), gaps, trends or other notable experiences or issues (at the intersection of national evaluation capacity and the 2030 Agenda) with a view to analyze the country’s readiness for evaluating progress in relation to the SDGs. The Mongolian case study will also include a particular focus on issues of public financial management and their relationship to evaluation of the 2030 Agenda era.

A detailed research methodology was developed by international consultants responsible for compiling and consolidating the regional synthesis report.

Due to time limitations, the case study did not cover all aspects of the national evaluation system in depth; with all stakeholders to provide a comprehensive study of the entire system. Instead, a ‘key-shaped’ research boundary - combining a broad scan with in-depth exploration of issues or areas that emerge as priorities with greater relevance — was adopted. The ‘key-shaped’ research boundary would assist in identifying the most important institutional opportunities and gaps in each country, with respect to the intersection of evaluation systems and processes with national SDG-related systems and processes.

**CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

Findings and Conclusions are not available as the project is currently being processed.

As a result of the case study, the capacity of the national system to evaluate the implementation of the SDGs will be identified and prioritized recommendations for capacity development are being developed. By adopting a consultative approach, the research team hope that interest and cooperation among key stakeholders will be enhanced.
RESULT-BASED MONITORING; DATA GATHERING AND ANALYSIS FOR PERFORMANCE INDICATORS OF ‘SUPPORT TO MONGOLIA’S TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING SECTOR’ PROJECT

CLIENT’S NAME
European Union (EU) project Support to Mongolia’s Technical and Vocational Education and Training Sector (STVET-1)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The main objective was to identify baseline data for performance indicators, to provide for monitoring the progress and achievements of the Support to Mongolia’s Technical and Vocational Education and Training Sector (STVET-1) project.
BACKGROUND

Established on 1 July, 2014, the STVET-1 project was a European Union funded intervention. Its objective is to support the economic development and human capital potential of the Government of Mongolia (and its citizens) by enabling key stakeholders to provide technical and vocational education and training, in a way that was responsive to the needs of a rapidly changing labour market.

PROJECT DESIGN

The main data collection method was a review of official statistics and related documents. This was for the quantitative indicators; at ‘impact’ and ‘outcome’ levels. For the qualitative indicators at ‘outcome’ level, field observations and checklist methods were used to verify statistics with real time observations at the VET centres.

The project had two levels of indicators, namely at ‘impact’ and ‘outcome’ levels, and the impact indicators were:

- Employment rate of TVET graduates.
- Reduction in the unemployment rate of TVET graduates.

The outcome indicators were:

- Enrolment in TVET programs as a percentage of total enrolment in formal education.
- Completion rate in TVET programs percentage (short programs).
- Number of TVET schools implementing competence-based programs.
- Number of TVET schools implementing the national quality assurance process.
- Number of TVET schools implementing the national certification process.

IRIM would be developing methodologies and collecting data for seven indicators, for which primary and secondary sources of information will be analysed. The research team completed data collection from 87 state and privately owned technical and vocational education and training institutes (TVET) in Mongolia.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The research was under completion, so no results or conclusions are currently available.
BASELINE SURVEY FOR THE “PARTNERSHIP FOR ORGANIC AGRICULTURE” PROJECT

CLIENT’S NAME
Adventist Development and Relief Agency Mongolia (ADRA Mongolia)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective of the research was to determine the target area for the project, and the context and background of the beneficiaries prior to the start of the project. For the baseline study, the following particular objectives applied:

- Analyse legal documents related to organic agriculture.
- Determine the current situation in the development of organic agriculture in the target area.
- Identify institutional and production constraints affecting agricultural cooperatives (as the project beneficiaries).
- Identify the knowledge, attitudes and practices of organic farmers and organizations.
- Define the conditions for cooperation of stakeholders in the field of organic agriculture.
BACKGROUND

In Mongolia, organic foods and organic agriculture are relatively new, and parts of a developing sector. Approval of the Organic Food Law (2016) encouraged the production of the organic food.

The purpose of this research was the identification of a mechanism for the production and processing of organic food; and ensuring the safety of organic food (including its registration and labelling).

This organic agriculture support project was a pilot, aimed at implementing the law; and more particularly, introducing a collective certification system for organic agriculture. Within the framework of the project, 31 cooperatives (located in 11 soums of Selenge aimag) were to support the development of organic agriculture through the introduction of value added organic products onto the market. The largest expected result of the project was to be the introduction of a ‘collective certification’ system, through the development of the multilateral partnerships.

As a pilot project, it was very important to define the pre-project baseline, as well as the plans for progress and evaluation.

PROJECT DESIGN

IRIM used both qualitative and quantitative research methods.

• Questionnaire. The sample consisted of the members and beneficiaries of the cooperatives. This data collection was to determine the types and organizational practices of the members in the cooperatives, as well as the knowledge, attitudes and practices related to organic agriculture.

• Group and individual interviews. This was conducted in each soum which included cooperatives, members, government representatives and other interested parties. This data collection was to determine the nature of cooperation - and the roles of stakeholders - in organic agriculture, as well as the direction to be followed.

• Literature research. This was to review the linkage between relevant legal documents, projects and programs.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The research was under completion, so no results or conclusions are currently available.
GENDER ASSESSMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE ACCESSIBILITY OF UNDER-REPRESENTED GROUPS IN ULAANBAATAR

CLIENT’S NAME
The Asia Foundation (TAF)
Finance provided by Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)

PROJECT OBJECTIVES
The objective was to identify barriers, and factors affecting the availability and accessibility of identified services among under-represented groups in Ulaanbaatar’s ger areas. The study employed gender lens, and the selected assessment criteria reflected the principles of gender-responsive public services. The study would assist the Municipality of Ulaanbaatar to improve its strategies for improving access to administrative services by under-represented groups, and help them to adopt gender-sensitive service delivery.
TAF, in collaboration with the Municipality of Ulaanbaatar, is implementing the Urban Governance Project, funded by the SDC. The project aims to strengthen subnational governments that are empowered, democratic, and accountable to citizens; providing sustainable services responding to citizen’s needs. The Urban Governance Project supports the municipality’s administrative decentralization of pro-poor services, piloting the delivery of targeted social welfare services at the khoroo level. The municipality is planning to relocate services to khoros over the next few years; especially those aimed at poor and disadvantaged citizens, including women. In so doing, the municipality adopted the principle of ‘leave no one behind’ and is aiming to promote a human-rights based approach to reach those who face barriers and are unable to receive public administrative services.

To design strategies to adopt gender sensitive and equity focused service delivery, it was necessary to understand and identify the barriers and challenges faced by under-represented groups and to identify factors that affect these barriers.

**PROJECT DESIGN**

This study will use a mixed-method approach to generate an accurate and comprehensive picture of how gender and equity are integrated into an intervention of programs and services. Mixing qualitative and quantitative approaches, while ensuring the inclusion of different stakeholders (including the under-represented groups) would offer a wide variety of perspectives and a more reliable picture of reality (UNICEF 2011). The study began with qualitative data collection and analysis followed by a quantitative data collection and analysis to construct a typology of respondents, and this will be followed by qualitative data collection.

**Figure 1. Sequential qualitative dominant mixed methods design**

Data collection in 11 khoroo of Ulaanbaatar will cover the following types of respondents:

- Desk review
- Key informant interviews
- Case studies
- Focus group discussions
- In-depth interviews
- Questionnaires
- Checklist

**GEOGRAPHICAL SCOPE**

Seven districts in Ulaanbaatar (Bayangol, Bayanzurkh, Chingeltei, Khan-Uul, Nalaikh, Songinokhairkhan and Sukhbaatar).
The study design employs ‘gender assessment’ criteria; that examines whether or not a current service is adequately promoting gender equality to reach development objectives. In this respect, six assessment criteria - with corresponding sub-criteria - were developed, including:

- Availability of services.
- Social accessibility; knowledge.
- Social accessibility; attitudes.
- Physical accessibility.
- Gender-responsive budgeting.
- Accountability.

**FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS**

A report will be published in June 2019 - in English and Mongolian — after completion of the study.